



A comparative study of the translations of Clarice Lispector's repeated fragments: a corpus-based investigation

Thereza Cristina de Souza Lima¹

ABSTRACT: Our research is mainly based on Corpus-based Translation Studies (Baker 1993, 1995, 1996, 2000, 2004; Blum-Kulka, 1986; Camargo 2005, 2007; and Scott 1998) and is related to one type of cross-cultural communication, the Brazilian literature translated into the English language. It is also based on the literary studies of (Gotlib 1993; Nunes, B. 1995; Ruggero 2000; Sá, O. 2000; Varin 2002; and Cherem 2003). The current study has two main objectives: the first one aims at investigating aspects of normalization in the translation of three books, written by Clarice Lispector – *A Descoberta do Mundo (DM)*, translated by Giovanni Pontiero as *Discovering the World (DW)*; *Uma Aprendizagem ou O Livro dos Prazeres (ALP)* translated by Richard A. Mazzara and Lorri A. Parris as *An Apprenticeship or The Book of Delights (ALP)*; and *Água Viva (AV)*, translated by Elizabeth Lowe and Earl Fitz as *The Stream of Life (TSL)*. As one of the main characteristics of the author is repetition, we have selected two fragments, which have been repeated in the three books analysed and translated by the different translators mentioned. This has enabled us to reach our second objective, which is to observe and compare these translators, whose source texts are the similar fragments, in relation to their own stylistic patterns.

Keywords: Corpus-based Translation Studies; Brazilian literature; normalization; style.

RESUMO: Nossa pesquisa é baseada, principalmente nos Estudos da Tradução baseados em Corpus (Baker 1993, 1995, 1996, 2000, 2004; Blum-Kulka, 1986; Camargo 2005, 2007; and Scott 1998) e é relacionada a um tipo de comunicação entre culturas diferentes, a Literatura Brasileira traduzida para a Língua Inglesa. Baseamo-nos também nos estudos literários de (Gotlib 1993; Nunes, B. 1995; Ruggero 2000; Sá, O. 2000; Varin 2002; and Cherem 2003). A investigação tem dois objetivos principais: o primeiro almeja investigar aspectos de normalização na tradução de três obras de Clarice Lispector: *A Descoberta do Mundo (DM)*, traduzida por Giovanni Pontiero como *Discovering the World (DW)*; *Uma Aprendizagem ou O Livro dos Prazeres (ALP)* traduzida por Richard A. Mazzara and Lorri A. Parris como *An Apprenticeship or The Book of Delights (ALP)*; e *Água Viva (AV)*, traduzida por Elizabeth Lowe e Earl Fitz como *The Stream of Life (TSL)*. Como uma das características marcantes da autora é a repetição, selecionamos dois fragmentos repetidos nas três obras em pauta e traduzidos pelos tradutores supracitados. Isso nos

¹Doutora em Estudos Linguísticos, atuante no grupo de pesquisa PETra II – Padrões de Estilo de Tradutores, coordenado pela orientadora Dra. Diva Cardoso de Camargo, Universidade Estadual Júlio de Mesquita Filho, UNESP, São José do Rio Preto; atualmente professora no Centro Universitário Uninter, Curitiba, e-mail tcslicristina@gmail.com.



possibilitou alcançar nosso segundo objetivo, que é observar e comparar esses tradutores, cujos textos fonte são fragmentos semelhantes em relação a seus próprios padrões estilísticos.

Palavras-chave: Estudos da Tradução baseados em corpus; Literatura Brasileira; normalização; estilo.

Introduction

It is undeniable that the digital age has brought about a revolution in many areas of knowledge including in the area of translation studies and consequently in the role of the translator, whose change has been much more profound than merely switching from paper to a computer screen. In fact, one of the most important contributions of technology in relation to translation studies concerns the use of corpus linguistics, that is, the use of electronic collections of texts, compiled according to specific research criteria, to analyze occurrences of linguistic patterns or features. Today many scholars make use of corpus linguistics to investigate translated texts, which, in Baker's words (1993, p. 234) "record genuine communicative events and as such are neither inferior nor superior to other communicative events in any language. They are however different, and the nature of this difference needs to be explored and recorded". Another important point, according to Baker (1993, p. 243) is the identification of "universal features of translation, that is, features which typically occur in translated text rather than original utterances and which are not the result of interference from specific linguistic systems". These features are a) explicitation, "an overall tendency to spell things out rather than leave them implicit in translation" (Baker 1996, p. 180); b) simplification, "the tendency to simplify the language used in translation" (Baker 1996, p. 181); c) normalization or conservatism, "a tendency to exaggerate features of the target language and to conform to its typical patterns" (Baker 1996, p. 183); and d) leveling out, "the tendency of translated text to gravitate towards the centre of a continuum, neither target-language nor source-language dependent" (Baker 1996, p.184).

The Study



Following an interdisciplinary approach, our investigation is mainly based on Corpus-based Translation Studies (Baker 1993, 1995, 1996, 2000, 2004; Blum-Kulka, 1986; Camargo 2007; and Scott 1998) and is related to one type of cross-cultural communication, the Brazilian literature translated into the English language. It is also based on the literary studies of Gotlib 1993; Nunes, B. 1995; Ruggero 2000; Sá, O. 2000; Varin 2002; and Cherem 2003. The study has two main objectives: the first one aims at investigating aspects of normalization in the translation into English of three books, written in Brazilian Portuguese by Clarice Lispector. As one of the main characteristics of Lispector's texts is repetition, we have selected two fragments, which have been repeated in the three books analyzed and translated by different translators. This has enabled us to reach our second objective, which is to observe and compare these translators, whose source texts are the similar fragments, in relation to their own stylistic patterns.

By means of analysis in a parallel corpus in the direction Portuguese – English, our research corpus is formed by the following subcorpora:

a) Subcorpus I, composed of newspaper articles:

- Source Text 1 (ST1): *A Descoberta do Mundo (DM)*, by Clarice Lispector, Rio de Janeiro: Rocco Publisher, 1984, 172.143 words;
- Target Text 1 (TT1) : *Discovering the World (DW)*, translated by Giovanni Pontiero, Manchester: Carcanet Press, 1992, 194.167 words;

b) Subcorpus II, composed of a love story:

- Source Text 2 (ST2): *Uma Aprendizagem ou O Livro dos Prazeres (ALP)*, by Clarice Lispector, Rio de Janeiro: José Olímpio Publisher, 1969, 36.385 words;
- Target Text 2 (TT2): *An Apprenticeship or The Book of Delights (ABD)*, translated by Richard A. Mazzara and Lorri A. Parris, Austin: University of Texas Press, 1986, 40.321 words;

c) Subcorpus III, composed of a fiction book:

- Source Text 3 (ST3): *Água Viva (AV)*, by Clarice Lispector, Rio de Janeiro: Rocco Publisher, 1973, 23.193 words;
- Target Text 3 (TT3): *The Stream of Life (TSL)*, translated by Elizabeth Lowe e Earl Fitz, Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press, 1989, 25.271 words.

d) Subcorpus IV, composed of repeated and re-used similar fragments, written by Clarice Lispector which are part of ST1 – (*DM*) / TT1 – (*DW*), translated by Pontiero; ST2 –



(ALP) / TT2 – (ABD), translated by Mazzara and Parris; ST3 – (AV) / TT3 – (TSL), translated by Lowe and Fitz.

In order to accomplish the goal, our entire research corpus, formed by the subcorpora I, II, III and IV mentioned above, was scanned, the optical reading errors were corrected and afterwards saved in *txt* language. This way, the whole corpus was prepared and ready for analysis. The development of the research followed three steps. Firstly, we did a qualitative analysis based on Lispector's critical heritage; in the second step, with the aid of the computer software WordSmith Tools, we extracted the wordlists and the keywords in the corpus, carrying out a quantitative analysis; thirdly, we raised and analyzed the concordance lines in relation to normalization aspects, this time in quantitative and qualitative analyses. Finally, since our subcorpus IV is composed of similar repeated and reused fragments, written by the same author, but translated by different translators, we carried out a comparative analysis among them to observe which one would present a greater tendency to normalization.

It is worth noticing that the repetition has been the object of study of several Lispector's researchers, such as Nunes (1995, p. 137), who observes the antagonist views between the silence and the repetition in Lispector's works. Also Sá (2000, p. 151) sees both, repetition and silence as ways to reach what may be unsayable and even Clarice, herself, assumes her tendency to repeat stating that "repetition is pleasant" (1964, p. 175). As mentioned before, we have selected two fragments, which Lispector has repeated and reused in the three books analyzed here: one fragment is entitled *The State of Grace* and the other *An Experience*.

As far as aspects of normalization are concerned, it is important to remember that in order to see whether the target text has been normalized and, if so, how the phenomenon is manifested in this text, we have compared one text to the other, that is the translated to the non-translated one. It has been done with the aid of the tool Concord, existing in the software WordSmith Tools, version 4. In addition, we examined whether and to which extent any shifts found might have contributed to the easy readability of the translated text. Thus, based on Scott (1998), by means of a qualitative study, we observed features of normalization related to repetition, text/sentence length, punctuation, and addition.



A) Repetition:

Several scholars have investigated the role of repetition in the text. For instance, in Galperin's point of view, (1977, p. 221) "repetition aims at logical emphasis, an emphasis necessary to fix the attention of the reader on the key- word of the utterance". For Thorne (2000, p. 476) "repetition is a device which emphasizes an idea through reiteration. It is a strategy for producing emphasis, clarity, amplification or emotional effect". Peters (2004, p. 471), however, associates repetition to cohesion and states that "a certain amount of repetition is important as part of the network of cohesion in any kind of writing".

In relation to repetition in Lispector's books, according to Sá, (2000, p. 77) "repetition is Clarice's way to build language". The excerpt below, extracted from the three books that compose our research corpus is an example of repetition, this turn not in Lispector, but in two of the translators:

- ST1 – (DM) *Não é nem de longe o que mal imagino deva ser o estado de graça dos santos. Esse estado jamais conheci e nem sequer consigo adivinhá-lo.*
- TT1 – (DW) It bears no relation to what I vaguely imagine the state of grace of saints to be. For that is a state of grace I myself have never experienced and cannot even envisage.
- ST2 – (ALP) *Nem de longe Lóri podia imaginar o que devia ser o estado de graça dos santos. Aquele estado ela jamais conhecera e nem sequer conseguia adivinhá-lo.*
- TT2 – (ABD) Lóri could not in the least imagine what the state of grace of the saints was like. She had never experienced that state and could not even guess at that state that she had never known.
- ST3 – (AV) *Não é nem de longe o que mal imagino deve ser o estado de graça dos santos. Este estado jamais conheci e nem sequer consigo adivinhá-lo.*
- TT3 – (TSL) It isn't even remotely like what I faintly imagine the state of grace of the saints to be. I've never known that state and I can't ever guess at it.

In the examples above, Lispector tries to describe the "state of grace" felt by the saints, but she does not repeat all the expression "state of grace" twice. In the second time, she just says "esse estado/this state", whereas Pontiero in TT1 – (DW) chooses to repeat the entire sequence "state of grace." The same occurs in the TT2 – (ABD)



translated by Mazzara and Parris who repeat all the expression “state of grace”, differently from Lispector who uses the objective pronoun “/o”. On the other hand, in the TT3 – (TSL), Lowe e Fitz opt for a more literal translation, not adding any repetition to the excerpt above.

This type of repetition might aim at facilitating the target language reader; therefore, it might be considered an aspect of normalization.

B) Text/sentence length:

Pieces of research investigating text/sentence length are divided into two main groups. According to the first group researchers, text/sentence length may vary due to intrinsic characteristics of the languages under investigation, such as Portuguese/English. The second group, however, into which Baker (1996, p. 181) is included, states that translated texts are longer than source texts because of the presence of features of explicitation. For instance, the use of the optional “that” in reported speech. In our research, all the subcorpora in the target language are longer than the ones in the source language.

An example of feature of normalization involving sentence length may be seen in the repeated and reused fragment below, extracted from the three books that compose our research corpus:

- ST1 – (DM) *Tudo, aliás, ganha uma espécie de nimbo que não é imaginário: vem do esplendor da irradiação quase matemática das coisas e das pessoas.* (23 words)
- TT1 – (DW) And everything acquires a kind of halo which is not imaginary: it comes from the splendor of the almost mathematical light emanating from people and things. (26 words)
- ST2 – (ALP) *Tudo, aliás, ganhava uma espécie de nimbo que não era imaginário: vinha do esplendor da irradiação quase matemática das coisas e das pessoas.* (23 words)
- TT2 – (ABD) In addition, everything began to acquire a kind of halo that was not imaginary: it came from the splendor that radiated almost perfectly from things and people. (27 words)
- ST3 – (AV) *Tudo ganha uma espécie de nimbo que não é imaginário: vem do esplendor da irradiação matemática das coisas e da lembrança de pessoas.* (23 palavras)



- TT3 – (TSL) Everything takes on a kind of halo that is not imaginary: it comes from the splendor of the mathematical irradiation of things and from the memory of people. (28 words).

In the example above, we can notice that the repeated and reused fragments are longer in the three translated books than in the non-translated ones. More specifically, TT1 – (DW) is 13.4% longer than ST1 – (DM); TT2 – (ABD) is 17.3% longer than ST2 – (ALP); TT3 – (TSL) is 21.7% longer than ST3 – (AV). As mentioned before, in Baker's point of view (1996), translated texts are longer than non-translated ones, due to the presence of aspects of explicitation or aspects of normalization existing in the target language. The use of longer sentences usually facilitates the understanding of the target language reader, so it might be seen as a characteristic of normalization.

C) Punctuation:

According to May (1997, p. 1) "punctuation had its origin as something fluid, it depended on a given reader's interpretation rather than being an inherent part of the written text itself. Punctuation marks were not placed according to rules of grammar or logic, they were a matter of rhetorical force". However, with the advent of the printing, punctuation marks became standardized and their purpose changed into showing the logical structure of sentences and paragraphs. In addition, rules and norms arose for their proper placement.

Today, many writers, including Clarice Lispector, challenge the grammatical norms by means of a personal and creative way of punctuation. Translators are also readers and writers and "tend to take liberties with seemingly minor details of punctuation and may change substantially the thematic or narrative force of the authors' sentence" (May 1997, p. 2). The repeated and reused fragment below, extracted from our research corpus, is an example of such shifts in translation:

- ST1 – (DM) É como numa anunciação. Não sendo porém precedida pelos anjos que, suponho, antecedem o estado de graça dos santos, é como se o anjo da vida viesse me anunciar o mundo.
- TT1 – (DW) As if awaiting an annunciation. But unheralded by those angels who presumably precede the state of grace of the saints. As if the angel of life were coming to announce the world.



- ST2 – (ALP) Era como uma anunciação. Não sendo porém precedida pelos anjos que, supunha ela, antecediam a graça dos santos. Mas era como se o anjo da vida viesse anunciar-lhe o mundo.
- TT2 – (ABD) It was like an Annunciation, although not foretold by the angels which she supposed preceded the grace of saints. But it did seem as if the Angel of Life had come to announce the world to her.
- ST3 – (AV) É como numa anunciação. Não sendo porém precedida por anjos. Mas é como se o anjo da vida viesse me anunciar o mundo.
- TT3 – (TSL) It's like an annunciation. Not preceded by angels, however. But it's as if the angel of life came to announce the world to me.

In the example above, we can notice that Pontiero, in the TT1 (DW), substitutes the comma, used by Lispector, for a full stop, differently from Mazzarra and Parris, in the TT2 (ABD) who do the opposite, substituting Lispector's full stop by a comma. As for Lowe and Fitz in the TT3 (TSL), there is no change in punctuation.

According to Malmkjær (1997) and Scott (1998), the comma constitutes a weaker kind of punctuation, compared to the full stop. Moreover, the addition of commas may aim at providing the reader with more time to process the information in the target language. Therefore, concerning punctuation, we may infer that these changes, made by both Pontiero in TT1 and Mazzarra and Parris in TT2, might be seen as aspects of normalization to facilitate the reader's understanding in the target language.

Another point that is worth mentioning is Mazzarra and Parris' choice in TT2 (ABD) for the use of capital letters when translating the words "Annunciation" and "Angel of Life". It may also be considered a shift that might be related to these translators' intention to provide a representative religious dimension to both, Our Lady, mother of Jesus Christ and the angels at the moment Mary received the annunciation, that is, the news that she was pregnant. In other words, this group of translators might be considering this episode as a magnificent event, unique in the Christian religious tradition. Nevertheless, it may not have been the author's intention, considering she was Jewish.

A second interesting example of shift in punctuation may be seen in the translation of the first eighty uninterrupted lines in subcorpus II, ST2 – (ALP)/ TT2 – (ABD):

- ST2 – (ALP)



,estando tão ocupada, viera das compras de casa que a empregada fizera às pressas porque cada vez mais matava serviço, embora só viesse para deixar almoço e jantar prontos, dera vários telefonemas tomando providências, inclusive um difícil para chamar o bombeiro de encanamentos de água, fora à cozinha para arrumar as compras e dispor na fruteira as maçãs que eram a sua melhor comida, embora não soubesse enfeitar uma fruteira, mas Ulisses acenara-lhe com a possibilidade futura de por exemplo embelezar uma fruteira, viu o que a empregada deixara para jantar antes de ir embora, pois o almoço estivera péssimo, enquanto notara que o terraço pequeno que era privilégio de seu apartamento por ser térreo precisava ser lavado, recebera um telefonema convidando-a para um coquetel de caridade em benefício de alguma coisa que ela não entendeu totalmente mas que se referia ao seu curso primário, graças a Deus que estava em férias, fora ao guarda-roupa escolher que vestido usaria para se tornar extremamente atraente para o encontro com Ulisses que já lhe dissera que ela não tinha bom-gosto para se vestir, lembrou-se de que sendo sábado ele teria mais tempo porque não dava nesse dia as aulas de férias na Universidade, pensou no que ele estava se transformando para ela, no que ele parecia querer que ela soubesse, supôs que ele queria ensinar-lhe a viver sem dor apenas, ele dissera uma vez que queria que ela, ao lhe perguntarem seu nome, não respondesse "Lóri" mas que pudesse responder "meu nome é eu", pois teu nome, dissera ele, é um eu, perguntou-se se o vestido branco e preto serviria,

então do ventre mesmo, como um estremecer longínquo de terra que mal se soubesse ser sinal de terremoto, do útero, do coração contraído veio o tremor gigantesco duma forte dor abalada, do corpo todo o abalo - e em sutis caretas de rosto e de corpo afinal com a dificuldade de um petróleo rasgando a terra - veio afinal o grande choro seco, choro mudo sem som algum até para ela mesma, aquele que ela não havia adivinhado, aquele que não quisera jamais e não previra - sacudida como a árvore forte que é mais profundamente abalada que a árvore frágil - afinal rebentados canos e veias, então

sentou-se para descansar e em breve fazia de conta que ela era uma mulher azul porque o crepúsculo mais tarde talvez fosse azul, faz de conta que fiava com fios de ouro as sensações, faz de conta que a infância era hoje e prateada de brinquedos, faz de conta que uma veia não se abria e faz de conta que dela não estava em silêncio alvíssimo escorrendo sangue escarlate, e que ela não estivesse pálida de morte mas isso fazia de



conta que estava mesmo de verdade, precisava no meio do faz de conta falar a verdade de pedra opaca para que contrastasse com o faz de conta verde-cintilante, faz de conta que amava e era amada, faz de conta que não precisava morrer de saudade, faz de conta que estava deitada na palma transparente da mão de Deus, não Lóri mas o seu nome secreto que ela por enquanto ainda não podia usufruir, faz de conta que vivia e não que estivesse morrendo pois viver afinal não passava de se aproximar cada vez mais da morte, faz de conta que ela não ficava de braços caídos de perplexidade quando os fios de ouro que fiava se embaraçavam e ela não sabia desfazer o fino fio frio, faz de conta que ela era sábia bastante para desfazer os nós de corda de marinheiro que lhe atavam os pulsos, faz de conta que tinha um cesto de pérolas só para olhar a cor da lua pois ela era lunar, faz de conta que ela fechasse os olhos e seres amados surgissem quando abrisse os olhos úmidos de gratidão, faz de conta que tudo o que tinha não era faz de conta, faz de conta que se descontraía o peito e uma luz douradíssima e leve a guiava por uma floresta de açudes mudos e de tranquilas mortalidades, faz de conta que ela não era lunar, faz de conta que ela não estava chorando por dentro

- pois agora mansamente, embora de olhos secos, o coração estava molhado; ela saía agora da voracidade de viver. Lembrou-se de escrever a Ulisses contando o que se passara,

mas nada se passara dizível em palavras escritas ou faladas, era bom aquele sistema que Ulisses inventara: o que não soubesse ou não pudesse dizer, escreveria e lhe daria o papel mudamente - mas dessa vez não havia sequer o que contar.

• TT2 – (ABD)

having been so busy, she had come from the shopping that the maid had done in a hurry because more and more she was becoming a sloppy worker, even though she came only to prepare lunch and dinner, and had taken advantage of the opportunity to make several phone calls, including a very difficult one to the plumber... then she had gone to the kitchen to put away the provisions and put the apples, her favorite food, in the fruit bowl, and even though she did not know anything about arranging a bowl of fruit, she had been drawn to it by Ulysses' suggestion that some day he might, for example, teach her how to arrange a bowl of fruit artistically... and because lunch had been so terrible, she noticed what the maid had left for dinner before going home and also noticed that her small terrace, a special privilege for her apartment, needed to be washed... then she had received a phone



call from someone inviting her to a charity cocktail party in honor of something that she did not understand completely, but that had something to do with the elementary school where she taught-thank God she was on vacation right now... and she had gone to the closet to pick out what dress she should wear to make herself beautiful for her date with Ulysses, who had already told her that she did not have much taste in clothes... she remembered that as it was Saturday, he would have more time because that day he did not teach summer classes at the university... she thought about what Ulysses was coming to mean to her and about what he seemed to want her to know: she supposed that he wanted to teach her to live only without suffering because he had told her once that when people asked her her name not to reply "Lóri," but that she might answer instead, "My name is I," for your name, he had said, is "I" ... she wondered if the black and white dress would do ... then from the very pit of her stomach, like a distant tremor that might be the sign of an earthquake for all she knew. . .from her womb, from her constricted heart came the colossal tremor of a strong pain that jolted her whole body. . . and in subtle grimaces in her face and body, finally and with difficulty, like a gusher of oil ripping up through the earth. . . finally the dry, silent sobs came, inaudible even to her. . . sobs that she had never supposed would come, that she had never wished for nor foreseen... leaving her shaken, like the strong tree that is more profoundly affected than the fragile one. . . and constricting her very veins and blood vessels. . .then she sat down to rest and after a short time she pretended that she was blue because twilight might be blue . . . she pretended that she was spinning out golden threads around her emotions. . . she pretended that she reliving her childhood, which was filled with shiny toys . . . she pretended that a vein had not burst open and that scarlet drops of blood were not dripping from her in the brightest silence and that she was not deathly pale, even though this was actually true. . . she needed in the midst of all her pretending to contrast the sparkling green of her pretendings with the solid truth. . . she pretended that she loved another and was loved in return. . . she pretended that she really would not have to die of longing. . . she; pretended that she was, after all, lying in the transparent palm: of God's hand, not as Lóri but as the woman with the secret name, which she could not enjoy for the time being. . . she pretended that she was alive and that she was not dying, for living after all meant nothing more than coming closer and closer to death each day. . . she pretended that her arms would no longer have to dangle helplessly at her sides whenever she became entwined in the fine,



chilling filament of the golden threads that she would spin, but did not know how to undo. . . she pretended that she was smart enough to undo the sailor's knot that bound her wrists. . . she pretended that she had a basketful of pearls just so she could gaze at the color of the moon, for she was like Diana. . . she pretended that if she were to close her eyes, her loved ones would appear before her and that when she opened her eyes, they would be moist with gratitude. . . she pretended that all this was not just her imagination. . . she pretended that her heart was filling with joy as she followed a stream of bright, gold light through a forest full of silent dams and serene mortals. . . she pretended that she was not like Diana. . . she pretended that she was not crying on the inside. . .

softly now, although dry-eyed, her heart was moist; she had not lost her voracious appetite for living. She remembered to write to Ulysses to tell him what had happened. . .

but nothing had happened that could be said in words written or spoken. . . that system that Ulysses had invented was a good one: whatever she did not know how to or could not say, she would write down and then silently give him the piece of paper... but this time there was nothing to tell.

It is important to remark that the fragment above was repeated neither in subcorpus I, ST1 – (DM) nor in subcorpus III ST3 – (AV). Consequently, we cannot compare the different translator's choices as we have done in the other examples. Nevertheless, this example is worth examining for two reasons. Firstly, in the TT2 – (ABD) we can notice the omission of the comma with which the book is started in the source language ST2 – (ALP) and secondly, there is an abundant use of ellipses in the TT2 – (ABD).

We believe the amount of ellipses used in the TT2 – (ABD) might cause a hesitation which would give the target language reader some extra time to process the sequence of Lispector's ideas in ST2 – (ALP). This time to think would tend to facilitate the comprehension of the text; therefore, it might be considered a characteristic of normalization.

D) Addition:

According to Newmark (1988), the addition may have three functions. It may be cultural, due to the differences between the source language and the target language; technical, when it is related to the researched topic; or linguistic, owing to the explicitation



of uncommon words. In the present investigation, we examine the linguistic function of the addition, which may be observed in the example bellow:

- *ST1 – (DM) Esse estado jamais conheci e nem sequer consigo adivinhá-lo. É apenas o estado de graça de uma pessoa comum que de súbito se torna totalmente real porque é comum e humana e reconhecível.*
- TT1 – (DW) For that is a state of grace I myself have never experienced and cannot even envisage. No, this is simply the state of grace of an ordinary person who suddenly becomes totally real since he is ordinary, human, and recognizable.
- *ST2 – (ALP) Aquele estado ela jamais conhecera e nem sequer conseguia adivinhá-lo. O que lhe acontecia era apenas o estado de graça de uma pessoa comum que de súbito se torna real, porque é comum e humana e reconhecível.*
- TT2 – (ABD) She had never experienced that state and could not even guess at that state that she had never known. What she was experiencing was merely the state of grace of an ordinary person which suddenly becomes real because it is common, human and recognizable.
- *ST3 – (AV) Este estado jamais conheci e nem sequer consigo adivinhá-lo. É apenas a graça de uma pessoa comum que a torna de súbito real porque é comum e humana e reconhecível.*
- TT3 – (TSL) I've never known that state and I can't even guess at it. It's simply the grace of a common person who suddenly transforms it into something real because it's common and human and recognizable.

In the example above, the group of translators in TT3 – (TSL) does not make use of any addition. However, Pontiero in the TT1 – (DW) as well as the group of translators Mazzara e Parris in the TT2 – (ABD) do use the addition, but in different ways. Whereas Lispector uses just the word “state” in ST1 – (DM), Pontiero repeats all the expression, “state of grace”. Also, in the same book, Pontiero adds the word “No” at the beginning of the second sentence, whereas Lispector does not use this negative adverb. As for Mazzara e Parris in the TT2 – (ABD), we can notice the repeated use of the expressions “that state” and “she had never known”.



Although the critics may not consider the author's vocabulary uncommon, her language is believed to be difficult to understand, with uncommon association of words, which might have caused additions to the text in the target language. These additions might aim at facilitating the understanding of the target language reader, so they might be considered characteristics of normalization.

Final Considerations

This small-scale study confirms the hypothesis that corpus-based translation studies enable researchers to access and interrogate vast quantities of data in both quantitative and qualitative ways, contributing to the turning away from prescriptive to descriptive approach.

Concerning our first objective, which is to investigate aspects of normalization in our target language corpus, we have noticed that Pontiero in TT1 – (DW) as well as Mazzara e Parris in TT2 – (ABD) and Lowe e Fitz in TT3 – (TSL) present, conscious or unconsciously, marks which may aim at facilitating the comprehension of the target language reader .

In relation to normalization, in a comparison between translators/author, the results achieved from analyses considering the repeated and reused fragments appoint to a higher frequency of aspects of normalization in the subcorpus TT2 – (ABD), translated by Richard A. Mazzara / Lorri A. Parris rather than in the subcorpus TT1 (DW), translated by Pontiero or in subcorpus TT3 – (TSL), translated by Lowe e Fitz. Nevertheless, in a comparison between Pontiero and the other two groups of translators, the results achieved show that both, Lowe and Fitz in TT3 – (TSL) and Pontiero in TT1 – (DW) present greater tendency to literal translation than Mazzara and Parris in TT2 – (ABD).

The findings above may lead us to infer that these features of normalization might be related to Mazzara and Parris's individual and distinctive stylistic patterns, whereas both Pontiero and Lowe and Fitz would present other different patterns of style, which might be closer to the text in the source language, consequently, there is a lower frequency of resources related to normalization.

It is worth remarking the importance of the translators' work to Lispector's international recognition, mainly the work done by Giovanni Pontiero, who, in 1968, received the Camões Translation Prize for his translation of Lispector's short story "*Amor*",



as well as the Rio Branco Prize for his work on Clarice's fiction books. According to Owen (1997, p. 136), the translation of the newspaper articles that compose the book (DW) "posed a great challenge to the translator", due to the wide range of themes approached and the different kinds of register used in these articles.

In relation to the applicability of our investigation, as we believe there are just a few pieces of research similar to ours in terms of our interdisciplinary approach, it is possible to foresee that this study may be source of future projects for researchers interested in studying the translation of literary texts.

References

BAKER, Mona. **In other Words: A Coursebook on Translation.** London & New York: Routledge, 1992.

_____. Corpus linguistics and translation studies – Implications and applications. In: Baker, Mona.; Francis, Gill.; Tognini-Bonelli, Elene. **Text and technology: in honour of John Sinclair.** Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 1993.

_____. Corpora in translation studies: an overview and some suggestions for future research. **Target.** n. 7, 1995.

_____. Corpus-based translation studies: the challenges that lie ahead. In: Somers, Harold. **Terminology, LSP and translation studies in language engineering, in honour of Juan C. Sager.** Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 1996.

_____. Linguística e Estudos Culturais: paradigmas complementares ou antagônicos nos Estudos da Tradução? In: MARTINS, Maria. (Org.). **Tradução e multidisciplinaridade.** Rio de Janeiro: Lucerna, 1999.

_____. Towards a methodology for investigating the style of a literary translator. **Target.** n. 12:2, 2000.

_____. Corpus-based translation research on legal, technical and corporate texts. In: Klaydy, K. **Across languages and cultures: a multidisciplinary journal of translation and interpreting studies.** Budapest: Akadémiai Kiadó, 2001.

_____. A corpus-based view of similarity and difference in translation. In: Arduini, Stefano. & Robert Hodgson, **Translating similarity and difference.** Manchester: St. Jerome, 2004.

BLUM-KULKA, Shoshana. Shifts of Cohesion and Coherence in Translation. 1986. In: Venuti, Lawrence. **The Translation Studies Reader.** London: Routledge Press, 2000.



CAMARGO, Diva. Cardoso. **Análise de corpora paralelos de obras da Literatura Brasileira contemporânea CorPLiBra**. 01/08/2007 a 31/07/2010. Projeto de pesquisa, processo 501869/2007-7, 2007.

CHEREM, Lucia. **Um Olhar Estrangeiro Sobre a Obra de Clarice Lispector: Leitura e Recepção da Autora na França e no Canadá (Quebec)**. Dissertação de Mestrado, Universidade de São Paulo, 2003.

GALPERIN, Ilya. Romanovich. **Stylistics**. Moscou, 1971.

GOTLIB, Nádia. **Clarice Lispector: A vida que se conta**. Dissertação de Mestrado, Universidade de São Paulo, 1993.

_____. **Clarice Fotobiografia**. São Paulo: Universidade de São Paulo Publisher, 2009.

LISPECTOR, C. **A Legião Estrangeira**. Rio de Janeiro: Editora do Autor, 1964.

_____. **Água Viva**. Rio de Janeiro: Editora Artenova, 1973. Print.

_____. **The Stream of Life**. Tradução de Lowe and Fitz. Minnesota: University of Minnesota Press, 1989.

_____. **A Hora da Estrela**. Rio de Janeiro: Francisco Alves, 1993.

_____. **A Descoberta do Mundo**. Rio de Janeiro: Editora Rocco, (1987, 1999).

_____. **Discovering the World**. Tradução de Giovanni Pontiero, Manchester: Carcanet Press, 1992.

_____. **Uma Aprendizagem ou O Livro dos Prazeres**. Rio de Janeiro: Editora José Olímpio, 1969.

_____. **An Apprenticeship or The Book of Delights**. Tradução de Richard A. Mazzara e Lorri A. Parris, Austin: University of Texas Press, 1986.

MALMKJÆR, Kirsten. **Punctuation in Hans Christian Andersen's Stories and in Their Translations into English**. In: Poyatos, Fernando. **Nonverbal Communication and Translation. New Perspectives and Challenges in Literature, Interpretation and the Media**. Amsterdam /Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 1997.

_____. Love thy Neighbour: Will Parallel Corpora Endear Linguists to Translators? **Meta**, vol. 43, n° 4, 1998.

MAY, Rachel. Sensible elocution: How translation works in and upon punctuation. **The translator**, 1997.



NEWMARK Peter. **A Textbook of Translation**. New York: Prentice Hall, 1998.

NUNES, Benedito. **O Drama da Linguagem: Uma leitura de Clarice Lispector**. 2ª edição. São Paulo: Ática, 1995.

_____. **O Dorso do Tigre**. São Paulo: Perspectiva, 1999.

OWEN, Hilary. **Giovanni Pontiero's Translation of Clarice Lispector's Discovering the World**. In: Orero, Pilar & Sager, Juan Carlos **The Translator's Dialogue**. Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 1997.

PETERS, Pam. 2004. **The Cambridge Guide to English Usage**. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2004. Print.

RUGGERO, Nube **O Olhar feminino nas crônicas de Maria Judite e Clarice Lispector**. Dissertação, Universidade de São Paulo, 2000.

SÁ, Olga. **A Escritura de Clarice Lispector**. Petrópolis: Vozes, 2000.

VARIN, Claire. **Línguas de fogo. Ensaio sobre Clarice Lispector**. Tradução de Lúcia Peixoto Cherem. São Paulo: Limiar, 2002.

SCOTT, Maria Nely. **Normalisation and Reader's Expectation: A Study of Literary Translation with Reference to Lispector's A Hora da Estrela**. Dissertação, Universidade de Liverpool, 1998.